DRAFT ONLY NOT APPROVED FOR INTRODUCTION

Post-conviction relief petitions-DNA evidence.

Sponsored by: Joint Judiciary Interim Committee

A BILL

for

1	AN ACT relating to criminal procedure; creating a Post-
2	conviction DNA Testing Act; establishing procedures for
3	post-conviction motions for DNA testing; authorizing new
4	trials as specified; prohibiting waiver of rights as
5	specified; limiting appeals of court decisions as
6	specified; providing a right to counsel for motions;
7	authorizing legal representation for needy persons as
8	specified; providing for costs; authorizing consensual DNA
9	testing; requiring victim notification; providing
10	definitions; requiring a report to the legislature;
11	amending requirements for retention of evidence as
12	specified; and providing for an effective date.

13

14 Be It Enacted by the Legislature of the State of Wyoming:

```
1
2
        Section 1. W.S. 7-12-302 through 7-12-316 are created
3
    to read:
4
5
        7-12-302. Short title.
6
7
   This act shall be known and may be cited as "The Post-
   conviction DNA Testing Act".
8
9
10
     7-12-303. New trial; motion for post-conviction
11
   testing of DNA; motion contents; sufficiency of
12
   allegations, consent to DNA sample; definitions.
13
14
        (a) As used in this act:
15
             (i) "DNA" means deoxyribonucleic acid;
16
17
             (ii) "Movant" means the person filing a motion
18
   under W.S. 7-12-303(c);
19
20
21
    (iii) "This act" means W.S. 7-12-302 through 7-
22 12-316.
23
```

1	(b) Notwithstanding any law or rule of procedure that
2	bars a motion for a new trial as untimely, a convicted
3	person may use the results of a DNA test ordered pursuant
4	to this act as the grounds for filing a motion for a new
5	trial.
6	
7	(c) A person convicted of a felony offense may,
8	preliminary to the filing of a motion for a new trial, file
9	a motion for post-conviction DNA testing in the district
10	court that entered the judgment of conviction against him
11	if the movant asserts under oath and the motion includes
12	all of the following information:
13	
14	(i) Why DNA evidence is material to:
15	
16	(A) The identity of the perpetrator of, or
17	accomplice to, the crime;
18	
19	(B) A sentence enhancement; or
20	
21	(C) An aggravating factor alleged in a
22	capital case.
23	

LSO-012	23.WI	
DRAFT	ONLY	

1	(ii) That evidence is still in existence and is
2	in a condition that allows DNA testing to be conducted;
3	***Staff Comment***
4 5 6 7 8 9	Requiring the movant to swear that evidence is still in existence and usable for testing appears to be a difficult, if not impossible, hurdle to overcome. This preceding paragraph (ii) may warrant further discussion.
10	(iii) That the chain of custody is sufficient to
11	establish that the evidence has not been substituted,
12	contaminated or altered in any material aspect that would
13	prevent reliable DNA testing;
14	
15	(iv) That the specific evidence to be tested can
16	be identified;
17	
18	(v) That the type of DNA testing to be conducted
19	is specified;
20	
21	(vi) That the DNA testing employs a scientific
22	method sufficiently reliable and relevant to be admissible
23	under the Wyoming Rules of Evidence;
24	

1		(vii) T	That a	theory of	defense can	be present	ed,
2	not	inconsistent	with	theories	previously	asserted	at

3 trial, that the requested DNA testing would support;

4

5 (viii) That the evidence was not previously

6 subjected to DNA testing, or if the evidence was previously

7 tested one (1) of the following would apply:

8

9 (A) The result of the testing was

10 inconclusive;

11

12 (B) The evidence was not subjected to the

13 testing that is now requested, and the new testing may

14 resolve an issue not resolved by the prior testing; or

15

16 (C) The requested DNA test would provide

17 results that are significantly more accurate and probative

18 of the identity of the perpetrator or accomplice.

19

20 (ix) That the evidence that is the subject of

21 the request for testing has the potential to produce new,

22 noncumulative evidence that will establish the movant's

23 actual innocence.

2 (d) The court may not order DNA testing in cases in

3 which the trial or a plea of guilty or nolo contendere

4 occurred after December 31, 1995 and the person did not

5 request DNA testing or present DNA evidence for strategic

6 or tactical reasons or as a result of a lack of due

7 diligence, unless the failure to exercise due diligence is

8 found to be a result of ineffective assistance of counsel.

9 A person convicted before December 31, 1995 shall not be

10 required to make a showing of due diligence under this

11 subsection.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

Staff Comment

Staff is uncertain what the significance of, or reason for, the last sentence in the preceding subsection is. The provision may raise an equal protection issue so there has to be a rational nexus between the provision and what it is attempting to accomplish. Another issue the sentence raises is the uniform operation of laws issue under Article 1, section 34 of the Wyoming Consititution. This provision may warrant more detailed discussion.

2223

7-12-304. Service of process; response by the state;

25 preservation of evidence.

26

27 (a) Notice of the motion filed under W.S. 7-12-303(c)

28 shall be served upon the district attorney in the county in

1 which the conviction occurred, the attorney general and, if

2 applicable, the governmental agency or laboratory holding

3 the evidence sought to be tested.

4

5 (b) The district attorney who is served, or the

6 attorney general, shall within sixty (60) days after

7 receipt of service of a copy of the motion, or within any

8 additional period of time the court allows, answer or

9 otherwise respond to the motion requesting DNA testing.

10

11 (c) The district attorney who is served or the

12 attorney general may support the motion requesting DNA

13 testing or oppose the motion with a statement of reasons

14 and may recommend to the court, if any DNA testing is

15 ordered, that a particular type of testing should be

16 conducted, or object to the proposed testing laboratory, or

17 make such other objections, recommendations or requests as

18 will preserve the integrity of the evidence, including, but

19 not limited to, requests for independent testing by the

20 state or procedures in the event that the proposed testing

21 will deplete the DNA sample.

(d) If a motion is filed pursuant to W.S. 7-12-

1

2 303(c), and the motion asserts the evidence is in the 3 custody of the state or its agents, the court shall order the state to preserve during the pendency of the proceeding 4 5 material and relevant evidence all in the state's 6 possession or control that could be subjected to DNA 7 testing and analysis. The state shall prepare an inventory of the evidence and shall submit a copy of the inventory to 8 9 the movant and to the court. If the state determines that 10 the evidence is no longer available, the state shall notify

other documents explaining the loss or destruction of the

the court and the movant of the loss or destruction of the

shall provide copies of chain of custody documentation or

15 evidence. After a motion is filed under W.S. 7-12-303(c),

evidence and explain its loss or destruction.

16 prosecutors in the case, law enforcement officers and crime

laboratory personnel shall cooperate in preserving material

18 and relevant evidence and in determining the sufficiency of

19 the chain of custody of the evidence which may be subject

20 to DNA testing.

21

11

12

13

14

17

7-12-305. Review by the court; hearing on motion,

23 findings; order.

1	
- 1	
- 1	

2 (a) If the court determines that a motion is filed in compliance with the requirements of W.S. 7-12-303(c) and 3 the state has had opportunity to respond to the motion, the 4 5 court shall set a hearing for not more than ninety (90) days after the date the motion was filed. If the court 6 7 finds that that the motion does not comply with the

requirements of W.S. 7-12-303(c), the court may deny the

9

motion without hearing.

8

10

11 (b) The hearing under subsection (a) of this section 12 shall be heard by the judge who conducted the trial that 13 resulted in the movant's conviction unless the judge is 14 unavailable.

15

16

17

18

Staff Comment

The Committee may want to consider what "unavailability" means, e.g., no longer on the bench, retired, death, illness, etc.

19 20

21 The movant and the state may present evidence by 22 sworn and notarized affidavits or by testimony; provided, 23 however, any affidavit shall be served on the opposing 24 party at least fifteen (15) days prior to the hearing.

DRAFT ONLY

1	(d) The movant shall be required to present a prima
2	facie case showing that the evidence supports findings
3	consistent with the facts asserted under W.S. 7-12-303(c)
4	and DNA testing of the specified evidence would, assuming
5	exculpatory results, establish:
6	
7	(i) The actual innocence of the movant of the
8	offense for which the movant was convicted; or
9	
LO	(ii) In a capital case:
L1	
L2	(A) The movant's actual innocence of the
L3	charged or uncharged conduct constituting an aggravating
L4	circumstance; <mark>or</mark>
L5	
L6	(B) A mitigating circumstance as a result
L7	of the DNA testing.
L8	***Staff Comment***
L9	The language in subsection (d)(intro) and
20	paragraphs (i) and (ii) were changed for purposes
21	of grammar and syntax from that provided to LSO.
22	The language provided did not indicate if
23	subparagraphs (ii)(A) and (B) would be in the
24 25	conjunctive or disjunctive, so an "or" was used,
25 26	but the Committee may decide, after discussion of this subsection, that an "and" would be more
20	appropriate.

23 evidence;

1	(e) If the court finds that the movant has presented
2	a prima facie case showing that the evidence supports
3	findings consistent with W.S. $7-12-303(c)$ and the evidence
4	would establish actual innocence, the court may order
5	testing, subject to W.S. 7-12-306.
6	
7	7-12-306. Designation of testing laboratory.
8	
9	(a) If the court orders DNA testing pursuant to W.S.
10	7-12-305(e), the DNA test shall be performed by the Wyoming
11	state crime laboratory unless the movant establishes that
12	the state crime laboratory has a conflict of interest or
13	does not have the capability to perform the necessary
14	testing.
15	
16	(b) If the court orders that the DNA testing under
17	W.S. $7-12-305$ (e) shall be conducted by a laboratory other
18	than the state crime laboratory, the court shall require
19	that the testing be performed:
20	
21	(i) Under reasonable conditions designed to

11

protect the state's interests in the integrity of the

2 (ii) By a laboratory that:

3

- 4 (A) Meets standards that at minimum comply
- 5 with the standards of the DNA advisory board established
- 6 pursuant to 42 U.S.C. 14131; and

7

- 8 (B) Is accredited by the American society
- 9 of crime laboratory directors accreditation board.

10

11 **7-12-307.** Discovery.

- 13 (a) If the DNA evidence being tested under this act
- 14 has been previously subjected to DNA analysis by either the
- 15 state or defense prior to the hearing conducted under W.S.
- 16 7-12-305, the court may order the state or defense to
- 17 provide each party and the court with access to the
- 18 laboratory reports prepared in connection with the DNA
- 19 analysis, as well as the underlying data and laboratory
- 20 notes. If DNA or other analysis was previously conducted
- 21 by either the state or defense without the knowledge of the
- 22 other party, all information relating to the testing shall

1	be	disclosed	by	the	motion	filed	under	W.S.	7-12-303	(C)	or

2 any response thereto.

3

4 (b) The results of any DNA testing ordered under W.S.

5 7-12-305(e) shall be fully disclosed to the movant, the

6 district attorney, the attorney general and the court. If

7 requested by any party, the court shall order production of

8 the underlying laboratory data and notes or chain of

9 custody documents.

10

11 **7-12-308.** Right to counsel.

12

13 A convicted person is entitled to counsel during a

14 proceeding under this act. Upon request of the person, the

15 court shall appoint counsel for the convicted person if the

16 court determines that the person is needy and the person

17 wishes to submit a motion under W.S. 7-12-303(c). Counsel

18 shall be appointed as provided in W.S. 7-6-104(c)(viii).

19

20 **7-12-309.** Costs of testing.

21

22 (a) The person filing a motion under W.S. 7-12-303(c)

23 shall bear the cost of the DNA testing unless:

1	
2	(i) The person is serving a sentence of
3	<pre>imprisonment;</pre>
4	
5	(ii) The person is needy; and
6	
7	(iii) The DNA test supports the person's motion.
8	
9	(b) In the case of person meeting the criteria
10	specified in paragraphs (a)(i) through (iii) of this
11	section, the costs of testing shall be paid by the state.
12	
13	7-12-310. Order following testing.
14	
15	(a) If the results of the DNA analysis are
16	inconclusive or show that the movant is the source of the
17	evidence, the court shall deny any motion for a new trial
18	based upon the DNA evidence and shall provide the results
19	to the board of parole.

20

(b) If the results of the DNA analysis are consistent with assertions contained in the movant's motion, the court shall set the matter for hearing on motion for a new trial.

7-12-311. Victim notification.

3

4 Following any motion filed under this act, the district

5 attorney shall provide notice to the victim that the motion

6 has been filed, the time and place for any hearing that may

7 be held as a result of the motion, and the disposition of

8 the motion. For purposes of this section, "victim" means

9 as defined in W.S. 1-40-202(a)(ii).

10

7-12-312. Rights not waived; refiling of uncharged

12 offenses.

13

14 (a) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, the

15 right to file a motion under W.S. 7-12-303(c) shall not be

16 waived. The prohibition against waiver of the right

17 provided under this section applies to, but is not limited

18 to, a waiver that is given as part of an agreement

19 resulting in a plea of guilty or nolo contendere.

20

21 (b) If a movant is granted a new trial under this

22 act, any offense that was dismissed or not charged pursuant

23 to a plea agreement that resulted in the conviction that

- 1 has been set aside as a result of this act may be refiled
- 2 by the state.

3

4 7-12-313. Appeal.

5

- 6 (a) An order granting or denying a motion for DNA
- 7 testing filed under W.S. 7-12-303(c) shall not be
- 8 appealable, but may be subject to review only under a writ
- 9 of review filed by the movant, the district attorney or the
- 10 attorney general. The petition for a writ of review may
- 11 be filed no later than twenty (20) days after the court's
- 12 order granting or denying the motion for DNA testing.

13

- 14 (b) Any party to the action may appeal to the Wyoming
- 15 supreme court any order granting or denying a motion for a
- 16 new trial under W.S. 7-12-310(b).

17

18 7-12-314. Subsequent motions.

- 20 The court shall not be required to entertain a second or
- 21 subsequent motion under W.S. 7-12-303(c) on behalf of the
- 22 same movant, except where there is clear and compelling
- 23 evidence that the evidence sought to be tested was

1 wrongfully withheld from the movant by the state or its

2 agents.

3

4 7-12-315. Consensual testing.

5

- 6 Nothing in this act shall be interpreted to prohibit a
- 7 convicted person and the state from consenting to and
- 8 conducting post-conviction DNA testing without filing a
- 9 motion under W.S. 7-12-303(c). Notwithstanding any other
- 10 provision of law governing post-conviction relief, if DNA
- 11 test results are obtained under testing conducted upon
- 12 consent of the parties and the results are favorable to the
- 13 convicted person, the convicted person may file, and the
- 14 court shall adjudicate, a motion for a new trial based on
- 15 the DNA test results.

16

7-12-316. Report to the legislature.

18

- 19 Beginning January 1, 2010 and annually thereafter, the
- 20 attorney general shall report to the joint judiciary
- 21 interim committee on any post-conviction DNA testing
- 22 motions filed and the results thereof.

Section 2. W.S. 7-2-105(r) and by creating a new

2 subsection (s) and 7-6-104(c) by creating a new paragraph

3 (viii) are amended to read:

4

5 7-2-105. Disposition and appraisal of property seized

6 or held; notice and order to show cause; judgment.

7

enforcement agencies shall preserve 8 Law (r)9 biological material that was seized or recovered as 10 evidence in the investigation or prosecution that resulted 11 in a conviction or adjudication as a delinquent for a crime 12 of violence and not consumed in previous DNA testing. The 13 biological material shall be preserved for five (5) years 14 or, except as provided herein, for as long as any person 15 incarcerated in connection with the case or investigation remains in custody, whichever is longer. Notwithstanding 16 any provisions to the contrary herein subsection (a) of 17 18 this section, a law enforcement agency may dispose of the biological evidence relevant to a felony criminal 19 20 prosecution shall not be destroyed unless and until the 21 person who was convicted in the case has died material 22 after five (5) years if the law enforcement agency notifies 23 any person who remains incarcerated in connection with the

1	investigation or prosecution and any counsel of record for
2	such person, or if there is no counsel of record, the state
3	public defender, of the intention to dispose of the
4	evidence and the law enforcement agency affords the person
5	not less than one hundred eighty (180) days after the
6	notification to file a motion for DNA testing of the
7	biological material. The law enforcement agency shall not
8	be required to preserve evidence that is required to be,
9	and has been, returned to its rightful owner, or is of such
10	a size, bulk or physical character as to render retention
11	impracticable. If practicable, the law enforcement agency
12	shall remove and preserve representative portions of the
13	biological material sufficient to permit future DNA testing
14	before returning or disposing of the material.
15	
16	(s) Whoever willfully or maliciously destroys,
17	alters, conceals or tampers with evidence that is required
18	to be preserved under subsection (r) of this section with
19	the intent to impair the integrity of that evidence, to
20	prevent that evidence from being subjected to DNA testing
21	or to prevent the production or use of that evidence in an

DRAFT	ONLY

1	fine of not more than ten thousand dollars (\$10,000.00),
2	imprisonment for not more than five (5) years, or both.
3	
4	7-6-104. Representation of needy persons.
5	
6	(c) A needy person who is entitled to be represented
7	by an attorney under subsection (a) of this section is
8	entitled:
9	
10	(viii) To be represented by the public defender
11	in a motion brought in accordance with the provisions of
12	the Post-conviction DNA Testing Act.
13	
14	Section 3. This act is effective July 1, 2008.
15	
16	(END)